

APPROVED MINUTES

JOINT MEETING of the STATE REVIEW BOARD and HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

September 19, 2013, 10:00 a.m.

Garth Newel Music Center, 403 Garth Newel Lane/U.S. Route 220, Warm Springs, VA

State Review Board Members Present

Dr. Elizabeth Moore, Chairperson
Joseph D. Lahendro
Dr. John Metz

Historic Resources Board Members Present

James Rich, Chairperson
Robert Johnson, Vice-Chair
William Garner
Terri Hauser
H. Edward "Chip" Mann
Lacey Ward

Department of Historic Resources Staff Present

Kathleen Kilpatrick, Director
Marc Wagner
Lena Sweeten McDonald
Randy Jones
Jennifer Pullen
Caroline Warner

David Edwards
Julie Langan
Joanie Evans
Michael Pulice
Catherine Slusser
Joanna Wilson Green

Guests present (from sign-in sheet) – Ann Adams (Switchback School), Terry Ammons (Switchback School), Chris Anderson (White House), Mary Blankenship, Claire Collins (Switchback School and John Wesley Church), Phil Dereming (Barton Lodge), (Bryan Green (Chesapeake Warehouses), Perlita Henry (John Wesley Church), Hamill D. "Skip" Jones, Jr. (C. P. Jones House and Law Office), Maral Kalbian (Huntland), Lori Kimball (Ball's Bluff Battlefield), Paul Lavigne (John Wesley Church), Mary Hills McCoy (C. P. Jones House and Law Office), Dr. Betsee Parker (Huntland), Dan Pezzoni (Ferrum College HD), Marianne Vardaman (Barton Lodge), David Wingfield (Chesapeake Warehouses), Deb Workman (C. P. Jones House and Law Office)

Historic Resources Board (HRB)

Chair James Rich called the HRB meeting to order at 10:07 a.m., welcomed everyone in attendance, and noted that the board members welcome public comment. He explained the role of the HRB and asked each member to introduce themselves. He then presented the June 2013 meeting minutes. With a motion from Mr. Ward and a second from Mr. Mann, the HRB unanimously approved the minutes.

State Review Board (SRB)

Chair Elizabeth Moore called the SRB meeting to order and welcomed everyone in attendance. She explained the role of the SRB and the process of designation, and invited each member to introduce themselves. She then presented the June 2013 meeting minutes. With a motion from Dr. Metz and a second from Mr. Lahendro, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the minutes.

Director's Report (DHR)

Director Kilpatrick thanked the staff of Garth Newel Music Center for hosting today's meeting and noted that 2013 is the 40th year of the center's operation. Four highway marker dedications took place in Bath County yesterday, and she noted the four nominations in Bath County on the agenda today. She recognized DHR staff Julie Langan and Jennifer Pullen for organizing and coordinating the events with local staff. Director Kilpatrick noted that a vacancy remains on the HRB and a new appointee has not been identified by the governor's office. She updated the boards on DHR staff changes, including the departures of archaeologist Brad McDonald and historian Peter Luebke and the arrival of historian Caroline Warner. She noted that federal funds for the highway marker program are expiring and that work has begun to identify replacement sources of funding. V-CRIS launched on September 18 and marks a major step forward in making DHR's data readily available. Director Kilpatrick noted the Werowocomoco project is being honored with a conservation award. She mentioned the large scale relic hunts that have become popular in recent years. DHR is working with professionals around the country to address the situation, to educate property owners about the harmful consequences, to persuade cable channels not to broadcast shows that glorify relic hunting, and to channel public interest in history toward productive projects. The statewide Virginia preservation conference will be October 21-22. Training for HRB and SRB members is planned to take place in late October or early November. A consultants Register workshop took place in August, and drew attendees from universities and local governments as well. On August 15, state grants for battlefield preservation were announced and will result in 14 new easements. Since 2006, 6,500 acres of battlefields have been preserved with state grants. There are 15 nominations on today's agenda, including 4 in Bath County and the state-owned Robinson House, as well as 3 highway markers and 5 new easements. A working draft of DHR's work plan has been provided to all members for review and will be taken to the public in the next month for comment.

Chair Rich thanked Kathleen Kilpatrick for her work on behalf of the Commonwealth and DHR staff. Vice-Chair Johnson noted it is a pleasure to see Director Kilpatrick has recovered from her recent injury.

Deputy SHPO Catherine Slusser presented DHR's draft work plan, explained the process for crafting the plan, noted highlights achieved from last year's plan, and presented targets for this year. Chair Rich asked that context sensitive design be included as a goal for DHR to work toward in its partnership with transportation agencies. Ms. Hauser asked for further explanation of DHR's easement monitoring process. Vice-Chair Johnson asked about the tax credit open houses hosted by DHR. Mr. Garner asked for the closing date of the public comment period on the work plan.

With a motion from Mr. Garner and second from Vice-Chair Johnson, the HRB approved a vote of support for the work plan.

With a motion from Mr. Lahendro and second from Dr. Metz, the SRB approved a vote of support for the work plan.

Ms. McDonald presented the following nominations for the Capital Region:

1. Fighting Creek Plantation, Powhatan County, #072-0015, Criterion C
2. **Robinson House, City of Richmond, #127-0741, Criteria A and C
3. **Tobacco Warehouses in Richmond, Virginia, 1874-1963, #127-6722, Criteria A and C
4. **Chesapeake Warehouses, City of Richmond, #127-6720, Criteria A and C
5. Woods, Major James, House, Nelson County, #062-0433, Criterion C

Comments made:

Mr. Bryan Clark Green and Mr. David Wingfield spoke briefly in support of the nomination for the Chesapeake Warehouses.

Chair Rich opened the floor to public comment. No comments were made.

With a motion from Ms. Hauser and a second from Mr. Garner, the HRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

With a motion from Mr. Lahendro and a second from Dr. Metz, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

Ms. McDonald said the nomination for the Chesapeake Warehouses included Criteria A and C. The City of Richmond's Commission for Architectural Review recommended that the nomination go forward under only Criterion A. Ms. McDonald requested board members to vote on the criteria under which the Chesapeake Warehouses would be nominated. With a motion from Vice-Chair Johnson and second from Ms. Hauser, the HRB voted to forward the nomination under Criteria A and C. With a motion from Dr. Metz and a second from Mr. Lahendro, the SRB voted to forward the nomination under Criteria A and C.

Mr. Edwards presented the following nomination for the Northern Region

1. Three Hills, Bath County, #008-0050, Criteria B and C

Chair Rich asked about the property's current use. It is currently vacant. Mr. Lahendro asked if Mary Johnston was related to the Johnston of Carneal and Johnston. Mr. Edwards said no family connection was found.

Ms. Evans presented the following nominations for the Northern Region:

1. Barton Lodge, Bath County, #008-0027, Criteria B and C
2. Elmwood Farm and Browning Store (2013 Boundary Increase), Culpeper County, #023-0044, Criteria A and C
3. **Huntland, Loudoun County, #053-0487, Criteria A and C
4. John Wesley Methodist Episcopal Church and Cemetery, Bath County, #008-5030, Criteria A and C
5. Jones, C.P., House and Law Office, Town of Monterey, Highland County, #262-5001, Criteria A, B, and C
6. Switchback School, Bath County, #008-5042, Criterion A

SRB

1. The White House, Page County, #069-0012, Criteria A and C (VLR Listed in 1979)

Comments made:

The board members commended various property owners for their work in preserving their properties and preparing nominations.

Chair Rich invited persons who had signed in to speak to make comments about nominations. The head of the Valley Program for Aging Services that owns the John Wesley Methodist Church spoke in support of its nomination.

Claire Collins, member of the Bath County Board of Supervisors, spoke in support of the four Bath County nominations.

Chair Rich invited the board members to comment. No discussion was made.

With a motion from Ms. Hauser and a second from Mr. Mann, the HRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

With a motion from Mr. Lahendro and a second from Dr. Metz, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

With a motion from Dr. Metz and a second from Mr. Lahendro, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the White House nomination as presented.

Mr. Pulice presented the following nominations for the Western Region:

1. Ferrum College Historic District, Town of Ferrum, Franklin County, #033-0286, Criteria A and C
2. **Roanoke River and Railroad Historic District, City of Roanoke, #128-6393, Criteria A and C

Comments made:

Chair Rich invited comments from the board members. Mr. Lahendro asked if the railroad line was identified as a contributing resource within the district. Mr. Wagner said railroad lines are usually considered part of the setting. Mr. Lahendro asked that the rail-related objects and structures within the district be mentioned in a description of the historic setting. Ms. Hauser asked if a letter of objection for Roanoke River and RR HD was received; Ms. McDonald said no, the summary of letters provided to Board members has a typo.

Chair Rich opened the floor to public comment. No discussion was made.

With a motion from Ms. Hauser and a second from Mr. Mann, the HRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

With a motion from Dr. Metz and a second from Mr. Lahendro, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

The joint meeting adjourned at 12:49 p.m.

AFTERNOON SESSION

HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

Historic Resources Board Members Present

James Rich, Chairperson
Robert Johnson, Vice-Chair
William Garner
Terri Hauser
H. Edward "Chip" Mann
Lacey Ward

Department of Historic Resources Staff Present

Caroline Warner
Joanna Wilson Green

Chair Rich called the HRB meeting to order at 1:50 p.m.

Jim Rich requested that the Board convene a closed session pursuant to Section 2.2-3711(A)(7) of the Code of Virginia for a staff briefing and discussion regarding possible litigation and/or enforcement action for a known violation of an easement held by the Board.

Motion was made by Bob Johnson to go into closed session.

Motion was seconded by Chip Mann.

Roll call vote in favor of motion to go into closed session.

Jim Rich: yea

Bob Johnson: yea

Chip Mann: yea

Terri Hauser: yea

Lacy Ward: yea

Bill Garner: yea

Closed session.

Board returned from closed session at 2:50 pm.

Jim Rich certified that to the best of each member's knowledge only public business matters lawfully exempted from open meeting pursuant to Section 2.2-3711(A)(7) and only those matters identified in the motion to convene closed session were heard, discussed or considered by the Board during closed session.

Roll call vote to affirm certification.

Jim Rich: yea

Bob Johnson: yea

Chip Mann: yea

Terri Hauser: yea

Lacy Ward: yea

Bill Garner: yea

Motion made to open meeting by Bob Johnson, second by Chip Mann.

Lacy Bennett Ward, Jr. departed the meeting at 3:02 pm.

HIGHWAY MARKERS

Miss Warner introduced herself to the board, noted that a third marker text for the General Assembly's Training School was added to the agenda as a walk-in, and then presented the following highway markers:

Sponsor Markers/Diversity

1. Sunray

2. Miller's and Eggleston Hotels

Sponsor

3. General Assembly's Training School for Lay Workers

Comments Made:

Marker #1: Sunray

Pam Schenian, TRPO, spoke on behalf of the marker.

Mr. Johnson made a motion to approve the marker with the board recommended textual edits. Ms. Hauser seconded the motion. The HRB voted unanimously to approve marker #1 as amended.

Markers #2: Miller's and Eggleston Hotels

Mr. Garner made a motion to endorse the marker on a contingent basis, with the provision that the board be given the opportunity to review edits to the marker text. Mr. Johnson seconded the motion. The HRB voted unanimously to contingently approve marker #2 and confirm the vote by email poll following review of edits to the text.

Marker #3: General Assembly's Training School

Miss Warner requested that the Board vote to approve that the concept of the marker was eligible, with the caveat that the text be revised.

With a motion from Mr. Mann and a second from Mr. Johnson, the HRB voted unanimously to approve the eligibility of the marker concept. The board offered editorial suggestions and reconfirmed that they would have final approval of the text through an email poll.

EASEMENTS

Easements for Consideration

Joanna Wilson Green presented new easements for consideration on behalf of Wendy Musumeci.

Mr. Garner briefly left the room.

1. Charles Hoge House, Newtown Historic District, City of Staunton

Property Owner: Dennis and Mary Kivlighan

Acres: 0.317

Motion to approve as presented by Chip Mann; second by Terri Hauser.

Approved: 4/0

Mr. Garner returned to the room.

- 2. Godsey Tract, Appomattox Court House Battlefield, Appomattox County**
Property Owner: Katherine Godsey, under contract to Civil War Preservation Trust
Acres: 3.67
Grant Funding (tentative): American Battlefield Protection Program

Purchase in fee by Civil War Trust using ABPP funding with removal of buildings following expiration of life estate of current owners. Staff recommendation was for requirement of written management plan with removal of non-historic buildings and structures within a reasonable timeframe to be negotiated with DHR staff.

Motion to approve with recommended conditions by Terri Hauser; seconded by Chip Mann.

Ms. Hauser and Ms. Bearns discussed how the requirement for removal of non-historic buildings interacted with the life estate.

Approved: 5/0

Mr. Garner departed the meeting at 3:30 pm.

- 3. Old Acre, Waterford Historic District, Loudoun County**
Property Owner: Sherry Satin
Acres: 0.54

Motion to accept as presented made by Chip Mann; seconded by Bob Johnson.

Approved: 4/0

- 4. Herren Farms, Rappahannock Station I & Brandy Station Battlefields, Culpeper County**
Property Owner: Herren Farms, LLC
Acres: 1,173

A motion was made to defer the project until the December Board meeting by Terri Hauser; seconded by Chip Mann.

Jim Rich asked that the EAC reconsider this and provide a recommendation and that staff continue to negotiate with the landowner concerning the number of division rights.

Vote to approve deferring until December 12, 2013 meeting with recommendation from EAC at that time: 4/0

- 5. Mignogna Tract, Petersburg and Peebles's Farm Battlefields, Dinwiddie County**
Property Owner: Mignogna and Mignogna, LLP, under contract to Civil War Preservation Trust
Acres: 2.52
Grant Funding (tentative): American Battlefield Protection Program

Staff recommendation is for inclusion of a written management plan with timeframe for removal of non-historic buildings and rehabilitation of the landscape.

Motion to accept subject to staff recommendations made by Bob Johnson; seconded by Terri Hauser.

Approved subject to staff recommendations: 4/0

Easement for Reconsideration

Ms. Wilson Green presented the following easement offer for reconsideration by the Board:

- 1. Beechtree Farm, Rappahannock Station I & II Battlefields, Culpeper County**
Property Owner: James E. Craig, Jr.
Acres: 52
Grant Funding (tentative): American Battlefield Protection Program

A motion was made to approve of the increase in acreage by Bob Johnson; seconded by Chip Mann.

Ms. Hauser and Ms. Bearns discussed the additional benefit the Board would obtain by placing the additional 20 acres under easement.

Approved as presented: 4/0

Program Policies

- 1. Easement Program Policy #2: *Acceptance of Easements***

Revision of existing policy to include addition of a sunset provision for Board approval of easement offers.

- 2. Easement Program Policy #7: *Easement Violations***

Revision of existing policy to include addition of a new category called Willful Violations.

Ms. Bearns introduced the proposed changes to Board Policies number 2 and 7 as shown on the redlined copies of those policies as provided to the Board at its June meeting and again prior to this meeting.

Mr. Rich confirmed that these were the same changes proposed in June.

Ms. Bearns asked if the Board had any questions or if they wanted to go through each document individually.

A motion was made to accept the revisions as shown on the documents provided to the Board prior to this meeting by Bob Johnson; seconded by Terri Hauser.

Approved: 4/0

Projects Completed since the June 2013 HRB Meeting

Ms. Wilson Green summarized the easements recorded since the June meeting to update the Board.

No action was required.

- 1. Hulvey Tract, Cedar Mountain Battlefield, Culpeper County**

Date Recorded: 06/07/13

Donor: Civil War Preservation Trust

Acres: 2.0461

Grant Funding: Virginia Civil War Sites Preservation Fund; Transportation Enhancement

- 2. Broomfield Tract, Cedar Mountain Battlefield, Culpeper County**

Date Recorded: 07/01/13

Donor: Civil War Preservation Trust

Acres: 4.467

Grant Funding: American Battlefield Protection Program; Virginia Civil War Sites Preservation Fund

- 3. Proctor Tract, Cedar Mountain Battlefield, Culpeper County**

Date Recorded: 07/01/13

Donor: Civil War Preservation Trust

Acres: 6.0

Grant Funding: American Battlefield Protection Program; Virginia Civil War Sites Preservation Fund

- 4. Webb Tract, Appomattox Court House Battlefield, Appomattox County**

Date Recorded: 07/02/13

Donor: Civil War Preservation Trust

Acres: 45.3 acres

Grant Funding: American Battlefield Protection Program; Virginia Civil War Sites Preservation Fund

- 5. Dobbs Tract, Totopotomoy Creek & Cold Harbor Battlefields, Hanover County**

Date Recorded: 08/07/13

Donor: Historic Polegreen Church Foundation

Acres: 2.0

Grant Funding: American Battlefield Protection Program

- 6. Simpson Tract, Sailor's Creek Battlefield, Prince George County**

Date Recorded: 08/08/13

Donor: Willie Leonard Simpson, III

Acres: 118.09

Grant Funding: American Battlefield Protection Program

A motion was made to adjourn by Bob Johnson; seconded by Terri Hauser.

Approved: 4/0

Meeting was adjourned at 3:55 pm.

STATE REVIEW BOARD

Chair Moore called the meeting to order at 2:50 p.m. at the Herter Hall at Garth Newel Music Center, Warm Springs, for discussion and consideration of the Preliminary Information Applications (informal guidance session).

State Review Board Members Present

Dr. Elizabeth Moore, Chairperson

Joseph D. Lahendro

Dr. John Metz

Department of Historic Resources Staff Present

Marc Wagner

Lena McDonald

Joanie Evans

Pam Schenian

Michael Pulice

David Edwards

Guests (from sign-in sheet): Sandra and Phil Charles (Lackawanna), Zach Grandle (Plains Mill), and Lori Kimball (Ball's Bluff Battlefield), and Dan Pezzoni (Columbian Paper Company)

Preliminary Information Applications

The following proposals were *endorsed*, unless otherwise noted, with the following comments:

Preliminary Information Applications

Tidewater Region.....presented by Pam Schenian

1. Cedar Grove Cemetery, City of Norfolk, #122-0104, Criteria A and C, Criteria Consideration D

The nomination was recommended to proceed.

2. *Town of Surry Historic District, Surry County, #308-5001, Criteria A and C

Dr. Metz noted the number of false-front commercial buildings in the town, and that the immigrant history is notable as well as historic-period use of restrictive laws to control settlement of African American residents.

3. Woods Hill, City of Franklin, #145-5032, Criterion C

Dr. Metz asked what the house is an example of. Ms. Schenian said it's associated with the "country place" movement, discussed in a book by Charles Gillette. Mr. Lahendro asked about the assignment of points on the rating sheet, and how this dwelling fit into the rest of the architect's body of work. He also wanted to know what influence the original property owners had on the design of the house. Dr. Metz wanted to know how the landscape design fit into Gillette's body of work.

Northern Region.....presented by Joanie Evans

1. **Ball's Bluff Battlefield and National Cemetery (2013 Boundary Increase), Loudoun County, VA, and Montgomery County, MD, #253-5021, Criteria A and D

Mr. Lahendro asked about the narrowed boundary near the southeast end of the district boundary. Ms. Lori Kimball said this portion is bordered by developed areas that would not contribute. Mr. Lahendro asked how the nomination will be handled since it includes land in two states. Ms. McDonald said the Virginia and Maryland SHPOs would coordinate on the preparation of the nomination, presentation to each state's review board, and send up to NPS.

2. ***Josephine City Historic District, Town of Berryville, Clarke County, #168-5029, Criterion A

Dr. Metz said the military headstones in the cemetery should be checked for association with US Colored Troops. The SRB members agreed that the district also has potential for listing under Criterion C due to the vernacular construction methods that are evident in some of the historic dwellings.

3. Lackawanna, Town of Front Royal, Warren County, #112-5351, Criteria B and C

Dr. Metz asked if the house had been found in a pattern book. Mr. Charles said books about 19th century architecture had been checked but found nothing quite like Lackawanna. Mr. Lahendro said Camden, built 1860 in Port Royal, is quite similar, and was designed by a Baltimore architect named Starkweather. Mr. Charles said plaster molding around the ceiling is identical to moldings in some rooms at Biltmore.

4. Plains Mill, Town of Timberville, Rockingham County, #082-5403, Criteria A and C

Dr. Metz said the Library of Virginia has Hinkle's Journals in its collection. The property owner, Mr. Grandle, said he had looked at the collection. Mr. Lahendro asked about plans for the property. Mr. Grandle said the machinery would be repaired and placed back in operation. Dr. Metz said the number and size of silos is notable. A grain elevator was used to move grains to the top of the mill and the grains then were gravity fed through the milling process. Mr. Lahendro said the nomination would benefit from including the historic process of the mill's operation.

Western Region.....presented by Michael Pulice

1. Columbian Paper Company Bristol Plant, City of Bristol, #102-5033, Criteria A and C

Mr. Lahendro asked if the pulp production process could be described in the nomination. Dr. Metz asked who owned the complex's architectural drawings. Mr. Pulice said the current owner has possession.

2. Walker Leffel House and Farm, Craig County, #022-5022, Criterion C, Criteria Consideration D

Dr. Metz said this is a very intact farmstead, and cattle farms in Craig County were not numerous. There appear to be two periods of outbuildings, although only one building dates from the earlier period. Dr. Metz asked how much acreage remains. Mr. Pulice said 245 acres. The house has hand-planed material, suggesting a mid-19th century construction date. Mr. Lahendro said the historic farming practice could be documented with the outbuildings.

Capital Region.....presented by Lena McDonald

1. Barrett Juvenile Correctional Center, Hanover County, #042-0126, Criteria A, B, and C

The nomination was recommended to proceed.

2. Foxland, Louisa County, #054-0354, Criterion C

Dr. Metz said the house appears to be an interesting survivor of a class of housing in rural Louisa County. The interior woodwork has a high level of integrity and is noteworthy. Additional historic context is needed to understand the architecture.

3. Fussell Mill House, Henrico County, #043-5256, Criteria A and C

Chair Moore asked to have the mill remains described in detail in the NR nomination.

4. Harris Farm, Albemarle County, #002-0878, Criteria A and C

Chair Moore said the location of the slave quarters should be documented and any remains described in detail in the NR nomination. Dr. Metz noted that the slave quarters was very intact at the time it was originally documented. The distance of the slave quarter from the main house is unusual, especially for a double-pen quarter. Field investigations might indicate the presence of other resources in the vicinity.

5. Huguenot Springs, Powhatan County, #072-0092, Criteria A and C

Mr. Lahendro said the springs are unusual for predating the Civil War – most resorts postdate the war. Dr. Metz and Mr. Lahendro said the property should be compared to similar resorts in the area to see if it has statewide significance.

6. **Laurel Meadow, City of Richmond, #127-0304, Criteria B and C

The nomination is recommended to proceed to listing.

Chair Moore adjourned the SRB meeting at 5:00 p.m.